

Report to the Southern Area Planning Committee

Date of Meeting	17 October 2013		
Application Number	13/03203/VAR		
Site Address	Brickyard Corner House, Donhead St. Andrew, Shaftesbury, SP7 9ER		
Proposal	Variation of Condition No. 10 of Planning Permission S/2013/0427 (pursuant to S/2012/0223 for 'Demolition of existing house, garage and workshop building, construction of new house and garage complete with site services and new vehicular access from Scotts Hill) to change the design of the house to allow for the creation of two additional bedrooms and a bathroom, the installation of 3 no. dormer windows; and, to change the design of the garage through the installation of 2 no. skylights		
Applicant	Mr B Tolmie-Thomson		
Town/Parish Council	Donhead St Andrew		
Electoral Division	Tisbury	Unitary Member	Cllr Tony Deane
Grid Ref	391915 125455		
Type of application	Var		
Case Officer	Matthew Legge		

Reason for the application being considered by Members

Cllr Tony Deane has asked that this application be called to Committee for the following reasons:

- 1) The Parish Council supports the application (localism)
- 2) The location and size of the house means that the appearance of these smaller dormer windows will have insignificant effect on the surroundings.

1. Purpose of Report

To consider the above application and the recommendation of the Area Development Manager that planning permission be **Refused** with reasons

2. Report Summary

The main issues to consider are:

- Principle of application
- Design, Scale and Siting
- Landscape setting and AONB
- Ecology
- Highways
- Neighbour Amenity

3. Site Description

The application site is located within the policy defined countryside and is located within an exposed and elevated location within the AONB.

4. Recent Planning History

S/1990/0134: Extension to form garage, utility and shower and construction of vehicular access. AC

S/2012/0223: Demolition of existing house, garage and workshop building, construction of new house and garage complete with site services and new vehicle access from new road. AC

S/2013/0427: Vary Condition 14 of approved application S/2012/0223 (demolition of existing house, garage and workshop building, construction of new house and garage complete with site services and new vehicle access from new road) to change the location the design of the garage. AC

13/01173/VAR: Variation of Condition 10 of approved application S/2013/0427 (pursuant to S/2012/0223 demolition of existing house, garage and workshop building, construction of new house and garage complete with site services and new vehicular access from New Road) to change the design of the house to include addition of second floor within existing roof void, insertion of 3 dormer windows to east and west elevations, new rooflights, bay window to north elevation, door and sidelights to south elevation, window to east elevation, new entrance, new portico and enlarged window to west elevation. REF

13/02454/VAR: Variation of Condition No.10 of Planning Permission S/2013/0427 (pursuant to S/2012/0223 for 'Demolition of existing house, garage and workshop building, construction of new house and garage complete with site services and new vehicular access from Scotts Hill) to change the design of the house to include bay window to north elevation, door and sidelights to south elevation, window to east elevation, new entrance, new porch canopy and enlarged window to west elevation. AC

5. The Proposal

To change the design of the house to allow for the creation of two additional bedrooms and a bathroom, the installation of 3 no. dormer windows; and, to change the design of the garage through the installation of 2 no. skylights.

6. Planning Policy

Adopted Salisbury District Local Plan; G2, D2, C2, C4, C5, C11 and C12 as saved within Appendix C of the adopted South Wiltshire Core Strategy.

National Planning Policy Framework

South Wiltshire Core Strategy: CP3 (Affordable Housing)

Donhead St Andrew Village Design Statement (Un-adopted Informal Planning Guidance)

7. Consultations

Parish Council

Support subject to conditions

Wiltshire Council Conservation

Concern expressed about new dormers and roof lights

Wiltshire Council Ecology

Objection to dormers in garage

Wiltshire Council Highways

No objection

Wiltshire Council Housing

No requirement for affordable housing

AONB

Concern expressed

8. Publicity

6 letters of objection have been received:

- Concern over new vehicular access onto New Road.
- Concern that the new dormers, bay window and entrance porch will provide further prominence to the dwelling.
- Inappropriate increase in scale of development with increased visibility to neighbouring dwellings.
- Concern over dormers in garage

9. Planning Considerations

This application has been submitted following the recent approval of S/2012/0223 and S/2013/0427. The Local Planning Authority (LPA) has always expressed some concern about the size and prominence of the replacement dwelling and as such during the course of the 2012 application the LPA successfully negotiated a reduction in the height and massing of the replacement dwelling. During the 2012 application the LPA acted in a reasonable manner and accepted two sets of amended plans which were both consulted upon resulting in the application exceeding the LPA's determination target date. The LPA has consistently sought to reduce the prominence of this building which by virtue of its exposed and elevated location will be openly visible within the special landscape setting of the AONB. The LPA took an on balance view towards the original application and approved the replacement dwelling.

Subsequently a 2013 application sought to relocate the location of the approved garage and as a result the LPA took the opportunity to approve the additional planting of about 8 or so trees within the approved amended application.

This application has now been submitted following the refusal of application 13/01173/VAR which sought in part the installation of the now requested three dormer windows. Whilst the Parish Council comment that the dormers are now smaller than those

recently refused, Officers considered that the three dormer windows within this application are visually the same size as the dormers which this LPA have already refused within application 13/01173/VAR. Thus there does not appear to be any change to the size or location of these three dormer windows.

This current application continues to seek for the further enlargement of the internal floor space of the building and seeks to create a dwelling which will now have 6 bedrooms together with 4 en-suites and an additional family bathroom. This application will effectively add an additional floor (within the roof) within the approved replacement dwelling. The new floor will require three additional dormers, two new sky lights.

Whilst the Parish Council (PC) have not in this instance objected to the application they have expressed a number of concerns but not concerning the massing of the dwelling. The PC has requested that the dormers in the garage be removed and that the dormers in the house are fitted with some form of automatic blind to minimise light pollution. However, the LPA is unable to enforce a condition to require the continued installation of automatic blinds but the PC (with this knowledge) appear to still wish to support the application subject to the garage being tied to the main dwelling.

Notwithstanding the Parish Council's comments a Wiltshire Council Conservation Officer has maintained the previously submitted comments: *"These proposed changes are at odds with our previous efforts which have been to rein in the rather ambitious plans of the owner/agent in view of the potential significant change in character to the vicinity when the current building is replaced and the new constructed"* This application has also received six letters of objection from neighbouring dwellings which have equally expressed concern about the further increase to the prominence of the approved dwelling. Some of the letters of objection also comment on the originally proposed dormers within the garage roof which have subsequently now been removed from this application.

Officers consider that the three new dormers within the roof will contribute towards adding undesirable prominence to the already large and grand replacement dwelling. Officers consider that any further increase to the massing of the dwelling tips the scale of what has previously been considered to have been acceptable. The additional dormer roof windows are considered to provide an unacceptable increase to an already large and grand replacement dwelling. Such an increase in the prominence of the dwelling is considered to begin to unduly detract from the character of the wider AONB. The AONB group has also added support to such a view by commenting that *"The AONB has looked at the submitted material and at the original approved plans and would agree with your Conservation Officer that these are very ambitious plans that would significantly change the character of the area"*

The National Planning Policy Framework states (Paragraph 109) that the planning system should contribute to and enhance the natural and local environment by protecting and enhancing valued landscapes. It also states (paragraph 115) that great weight should be given to conserving landscape and scenic beauty in the AONBs which have the highest status of protection in relation to landscape and scenic beauty. The LPA have already accepted that the replacement dwelling will be prominently located but is unwilling to support continued accretions to the already grand dwelling which are perceived to result in undue dominance within the surrounding landscape setting. This application in its current form is considered to be unacceptable.

10. Conclusion

There is no material change to this application's proposed dormer windows (within the main dwelling) when compared to those which have already recently been refused within 13/01173/VAR. The views of the LPA are therefore maintained in that, it is considered that this application will contribute towards adding undesirable prominence to the already large and grand replacement dwelling to the detriment of the character of the AONB.

RECOMMENDATION

To REFUSE planning permission for the following reason:

The introduction of a habitable third storey into this replacement house and the related insertion of dormer windows would result in a development which is significantly larger and far greater in impact and prominence than the existing two storey house and the previously approved two storey replacement house. As a consequence of these changes to the size/design and impact the replacement house would detract from the visual amenities of the landscape, neither preserving nor enhancing its status as an Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty. This is contrary to Policies H30, C4 and C5 of the Salisbury District Local Plan (which are 'saved' policies set out in the South Wiltshire Core Strategy) together with paragraph 109 of the National Planning Policy Framework.

Informative

In accordance with paragraph 187 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF), this planning application has been processed in a proactive way. However, due to technical objections or the proposal's failure to comply with the development plan and/or the NPPF as a matter of principle, the local planning authority has had no alternative other than to refuse planning permission.